



**Legislative Assembly
Province of Alberta**

No. 5

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

Fourth Session

Twenty-Fourth Legislature

Monday, February 28, 2000

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

Presenting Petitions

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 220 Albertans requesting the introduction of a bill banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals in Alberta to maintain the integrity of the public, universal health care system.

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, presented a petition from 258 Edmonton and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, presented a petition from 255 Edmonton residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, presented a petition from 273 Edmonton residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, presented a petition from 214 Edmonton and area residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, presented a petition from 252 Edmonton residents requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Reading and Receiving Petitions

On request by Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Sapers, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glenora, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of the province of Alberta, hereby petition the Legislative Assembly of Alberta to pass a bill banning private for-profit hospitals in Alberta so that the integrity of the public, universal health care system may be maintained.

Notices of Motions

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, gave oral notice of his intention to move the following motion under Standing Order 40:

Be it resolved that the Assembly affirm the importance of open access to reading material by recognizing February 27 to March 4, 2000 as "Freedom to Read Week".

Introduction of Bills (First Reading)

Notice having been given:

Bill 6 Special Payment Act — Hon. Mr. Dunford

Upon recommendation of Her Honour the Honourable the Lieutenant Governor, and notice having been given:

Bill 9 Appropriation (Interim Supply) Act, 2000 (\$) — Hon. Mr. Day

Tabling Returns and Reports

Hon. Mr. Day, Provincial Treasurer, pursuant to the Conflicts of Interest Act, cC-22.1, s16 and the Legislative Assembly Act, cL-10.1,s43:

Report of Selected Payments to Members and Former Members of the Legislative Assembly and Persons Directly Associated with Members of the Legislative Assembly for the Year Ended March 31, 1999

Sessional Paper 71/2000

Hon. Mr. Day, Provincial Treasurer:

General Revenue Fund Details of Expenditure by Payee for the Year Ended March 31, 1999

Sessional Paper 72/2000

Hon. Mr. Day, Provincial Treasurer:

Selected Payments Report for Members of the Legislative Assembly relating to Remuneration and Benefits, Allowances and Travel Expenses for the year ended March 31, 1999

Sessional Paper 73/2000

Hon. Dr. West, Minister of Resource Development:

Return to Order of the Assembly No. MR205 asked for by Ms Carlson on April 21, 1999:

A copy of the most recent inventory of oilfield waste in Alberta, including inverts and/or oil based drilling mud and the methods being used for their disposal.

Sessional Paper 74/2000

Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness:

Return to Order of the Assembly No. MR207 asked for by Mrs. Soetaert on April 28, 1999:

The number of individuals for whom the Aspen Regional Health Authority #11 is financially responsible who are receiving continuing care and who are receiving home care.

Sessional Paper 75/2000

Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness:

Return to Order of the Assembly No. MR209 asked for by Mrs. Soetaert on April 28, 1999:

Copies of letters, memoranda, written communications in whatever form and however stored, between Alberta Health and Regional Health Authorities defining administration, other direct labour costs, material costs, and capital costs for the purposes of cost accounting.

Sessional Paper 76/2000

Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness:

Responses to questions raised in the Committee of Supply, Department of Health and Wellness, 1999-2000 Supplementary Estimates consideration December 1, 1999

Sessional Paper 77/2000

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark:

Report dated February 7, 2000 entitled "Regional Health Planning and Delivery in Alberta: A Basic Cost-Benefits Analysis in Response to a Health System Performance Issue" prepared by Donna Wilson, RN, PhD

Sessional Paper 78/2000

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark:

Booklet entitled "Private Profit or the Public Good: The Economics and Politics of the Privatization of Health Care in Alberta" prepared by Kevin Taft and Gillian Steward

Sessional Paper 79/2000

Ms Paul, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Castle Downs:

Letter dated February 11, 2000 from Blyth D. Irvine to Ms Paul, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Castle Downs, regarding the 2-tier health care system in Europe

Sessional Paper 80/2000

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie:

Report entitled "The Urgent Need for Endangered Species Legislation in Canada" prepared by D.W. Schindler, Department of Biological Sciences, University of Alberta

Sessional Paper 81/2000

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre:

Newsletter and Calendar of Events, dated February 2000, from Women Looking Forward group of Calgary

Sessional Paper 82/2000

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry:

Letter and attachments dated February 17, 2000 from Allan P. Jobson of Calgary, regarding the Ombudsman's investigation into the claim of Les Lattery by the Workers' Compensation Board

Sessional Paper 83/2000

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry:

Program from Investiture of Lifesaving Honours given by the Lifesaving Society, Alberta and Northwest Territories Branch, February 28, 2000

Sessional Paper 84/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

Letter dated February 28, 2000 from Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, requesting the Premier's intervention regarding the deportation of Leticia Cables

Sessional Paper 85/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

Booklet entitled "Private Profit or the Public Good: The Economics and Politics of the Privatization of Health Care in Alberta" prepared by Kevin Taft and Gillian Steward

Sessional Paper 86/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

Report dated February 5, 2000 entitled "The Role of Private and Public Health Care Delivery in Alberta" prepared by Robert G. Evans, Professor, University of British Columbia

Sessional Paper 87/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

Summary of a study dated January 21, 2000 entitled "The Consumer Experience With Cataract Surgery and Private Clinics in Alberta" prepared by the Consumers' Association of Alberta

Sessional Paper 88/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

E-mail dated February 18, 2000 from Dale Henkel to Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, regarding current fuel prices and the farm fuel tax

Sessional Paper 89/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

E-mail dated February 1, 2000 from Bonnie Nasim to Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, regarding the proposed development of Spray Valley
Sessional Paper 90/2000

Hon. Mr. Day, Provincial Treasurer:

Report dated February 24, 2000 entitled "Budget Highlights: Alberta — Another Day in Paradise" prepared by Scott Kinnear, Douglas Porter, and David Rosenberg of Nesbitt Burns
Sessional Paper 91/2000

Hon. Mr. Kowalski, Speaker of the Legislative Assembly:

Memorandum from Mr. Doerksen, Hon. Member for Red Deer-South, requesting that Bill 202, Marriage Amendment Act, 2000, be brought to Committee of the Whole for consideration on Wednesday, March 1, 2000
Sessional Paper 92/2000

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar:

Press Release dated August 18, 1997, regarding Georgia-Pacific compensation to homeowners for exterior hardboard siding
Sessional Paper 93/2000

Oral Question Period

During Oral Question Period, Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, tabled the following:

Excerpt from Issue 75 of The Messenger publication entitled "Opting Out: Draft Guidelines for Discussion" regarding the publicly-funded health care system
Sessional Paper 94/2000

Recognitions

Mr. Johnson, Hon. Member for Wetaskiwin-Camrose: The hard work and dedication of competitors and volunteers at the Provincial High School Wrestling Championships held at Wetaskiwin Composite High School February 25-27, 2000.

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert: Scout/Guide Week, February 20-27, 2000 and the fourth Spruce Grove annual Lord Baden-Powell banquet held February 23, 2000.

Mrs. O'Neill, Hon. Member for St. Albert: Capital Health Authority's Meningitis Immunization Operation, February 14-28, 2000.

Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods: Freedom to Read Week, February 27 to March 4, 2000.

Mrs. Burgener, Hon. Member for Calgary-Currie: Alberta-based Canadian National Soccer Team for winning their first Gold Cup title.

Motions Under Standing Order 40

Mr. Dickson, Hon Member for Calgary-Buffalo requested the unanimous consent of the Assembly for consideration of the following motion:

Be it resolved that the Assembly affirm the importance of open access to reading material by recognizing February 27 to March 4, 2000 as “Freedom to Read Week”.

Unanimous consent to proceed was not granted.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Committee of Supply (Main Estimates)

According to Order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of Supply.

(Assembly in Committee)

The Chairman called for consideration of the motion proposing the establishment of four subcommittees of the Committee of Supply.

A debate followed.

The question being put, with Mrs. Gordon in the Chair, the motion was agreed to. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 44

Boutilier	Haley	Melchin
Broda	Hancock	O'Neill
Burgener	Havelock	Pham
Calahasen	Herard	Renner
Cao	Hierath	Smith
Cardinal	Jacques	Stelmach
Clegg	Johnson	Stevens
Doerksen	Jonson	Strang
Ducharme	Klapstein	Tannas
Dunford	Laing	Taylor
Evans	Langevin	Trynchy
Forsyth	Lougheed	West
Friedel	Magnus	Woloshyn
Fritz	Mar	Yankowsky
Graham	McClellan	

Against the motion: 8

Blakeman	Gibbons	Soetaert
Bonner	Olsen	White
Dickson	Paul	

The motion read as follows:

Be it resolved that:

1. Pursuant to Standing Order 57(1), four (4) subcommittees of the Committee of Supply be established by the Committee of Supply with the following names:

- Subcommittee A
- Subcommittee B
- Subcommittee C
- Subcommittee D

2. The membership of the respective subcommittees be as follows:

Subcommittee A

Gordon (Chair)	Ducharme	Lougheed
Severtson (Deputy Chair)	Dunford	Mar
Bonner	Friedel	Pannu
Boutilier	Hierath	Sapers
Burgener	Klapstein	Smith
Cao	Jacques	Wickman
Cardinal	Johnson	

Subcommittee B

Tannas (Chair)	Hancock	Soetaert
Laing (Deputy Chair)	Kryczka	Stelmach
Blakeman	Leibovici	Stevens
Calahasen	Massey	Tarchuk
Doerksen	McClellan	Woloshyn
Forsyth	Melchin	Zwozdesky
Fritz	Olsen	
Graham	Sloan	

Subcommittee C

Tannas (Chair)	MacDonald	Soetaert
Fischer (Deputy Chair)	McFarland	Strang
Cao	Nelson	Thurber
Evans	Nicol	Trynchy
Gibbons	Oberg	Yankowsky
Jonson	O'Neill	
Lund	Paszkowski	

Subcommittee D

Gordon (Chair)	Herard	Sapers
Renner (Deputy Chair)	Hlady	Shariff
Amery	Langevin	Taylor
Broda	Magnus	West
Carlson	Pannu	White
Coutts	Paul	
Havelock	Pham	

3. The following portions of the main estimates (The "Main Estimates") of expenditure for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2001, unless previously designated by the Leader of the Opposition to be considered by the Designated Supply Subcommittees, be referred to the subcommittees for their reports to the Committee of Supply as follows:

Subcommittee A

Executive Council
Gaming
Treasury

Subcommittee B

Community Development
International and Intergovernmental Relations
Infrastructure
Justice and Attorney General

Subcommittee C

Agriculture, Food and Rural Development
Government Services
Municipal Affairs

Subcommittee D

Resource Development
Economic Development
Innovation and Science

4. When the Committee of Supply is called to consider the Main Estimates it shall, on the six (6) calendar days after the agreement of the motion establishing the subcommittees, excluding Thursdays designated by the Official Opposition, when Main Estimates are under consideration, resolve itself into two (2) of the four (4) subcommittees, both of which shall meet and report to the Committee of Supply.

And after some time spent therein, the Acting Speaker resumed the Chair and Mr. Herard reported as follows:

Madam Speaker:

The Committee of Supply has had under consideration certain motions to establish subcommittees of the Committee of Supply and reports the approval thereof.

Madam Speaker, I would like to table copies of the motion agreed to this day in Committee of Supply establishing 4 subcommittees of the Committee of Supply and their membership.

Sessional Paper 96/2000

Madam Speaker, I would also like to table copies of the motion agreed to this day in Committee of Supply appointing Members to Designated Supply Subcommittees under Standing Order 56(2):

Learning

Stevens (Chair)	Graham	O'Neill
Burgener	Hlady	Pannu
Dickson	Johnson	Severtson
Fischer	Massey	Soetaert

Environmental Protection

Hierath (Chair)	Coutts	Pannu
Amery	Ducharme	Sloan
Boutilier	Langevin	Strang
Carlson	Magnus	White

Children's Services

Melchin (Chair)	Kryczka	Massey
Cao	Laing	Paul
Cardinal	Lougheed	Shariff
Johnson	MacDonald	Sloan

Health

Tarchuk (Chair)	Forsyth	Leibovici
Broda	Fritz	Pannu
Dickson	Herard	Pham
Doerksen	Jacques	Sloan

Human Resources

Friedel (Chair)	Klapstein	Paul
Bonner	MacDonald	Renner
Ducharme	Marz	Thurber
Gibbons	McFarland	Yankowsky

Sessional Paper 97/2000

Madam Speaker, I would like to table copies of a letter from Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, designating the estimates for consideration of five departments by the Designated Supply Subcommittees pursuant to Standing Order 56(2)(a):

Health and Wellness
Learning
Environmental Protection
Human Resources
Children's Services

Sessional Paper 95/2000

Consideration of Her Honour the Lieutenant Governor's Speech (Day 3)

Moved by Ms Haley and seconded by Mr. Lougheed:

That an humble address be presented to Her Honour the Lieutenant Governor as follows:

To Her Honour Mrs. Lois E. Hole, the Lieutenant Governor of the Province of Alberta:

We, Her Majesty's most dutiful and loyal subjects, the Legislative Assembly, now assembled, beg leave to thank Your Honour for the gracious speech Your Honour has been pleased to address to us at the opening of the present session.

A debate followed.

Mr. White moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

Government Motions

15. Moved by Hon. Mr. Day:

Be it resolved that the Assembly approve in general the business plans and fiscal policies of the Government.

A debate followed.

Hon. Mrs McClellan moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Hancock Government House Leader, that it be called 5:30 p.m., it was agreed at 5:20 p.m. that when the Assembly reconvened at 8:00 p.m. it would be in Committee of Supply, and the Deputy Speaker left the Chair

MONDAY, FEBRUARY 28, 2000 — 8:00 P.M.

Committee of Supply (Main Estimates)

(Assembly in Committee)

And after some time spent therein, the Deputy Speaker assumed the Chair and Mr. Herard reported as follows:

Mr. Speaker:

The Committee of Supply has had under consideration certain resolutions of the 1999-2000 Supplementary Supply Estimates (No. 2), reports as follows and requests leave to sit again.

Resolved that a sum not exceeding the following be granted to Her Majesty for the fiscal year ending March 31, 2000, for the Departments and purposes indicated:

Department of Justice and Attorney General

\$5,700,000 Operating Expense and Capital Investment

Department of Health and Wellness

\$10,412,000 Operating Expense

Department of Environment

\$6,000,000 Operating Expense and Capital Investment

Department of Community Development

\$8,991,000 Operating Expense and Capital Investment

\$1,470,000 Non-budgetary Disbursements

Sessional Paper 98/2000

The question being put, the report and the request for leave to sit again were agreed to.

Consideration of Her Honour the Lieutenant Governor's Speech (Day 3)

Moved by Ms Haley and seconded by Mr. Lougheed:

That an humble address be presented to Her Honour the Lieutenant Governor as follows:

To Her Honour Mrs. Lois E. Hole, the Lieutenant Governor of the Province of Alberta:

We, Her Majesty's most dutiful and loyal subjects, the Legislative Assembly, now assembled, beg leave to thank Your Honour for the gracious speech Your Honour has been pleased to address to us at the opening of the present session.

A debate followed.

Hon. Mrs. McClellan moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Hancock, Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 10:05 p.m. until Tuesday, February 29, 2000, at 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Ken Kowalski,
Speaker

Title: Monday, February 28, 2000